

FREQUENCY OF STAFF DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMS AND TEACHERS' JOB PERFORMANCE IN KWARA STATE PRIMARY SCHOOLS, NIGERIA

Fashiku Christopher Oluwatoyin¹, Atere Kafayat Jumoke², Agbaje Ezekiel Ayowole³

^{1,2} Department of Educational Management, Faculty of Education, Obafemi Awolowo University, Ile-Ife, Nigeria

³ PMB/MIS Unit, Obafemi Awolowo University, Ile-Ife, Nigeria

Article Info

Article history:

Received July 15, 2023

Revised September 20, 2023

Accepted September 22, 2023

Keywords:

Staff;

Development Program;

Teachers' Task;

Performance;

Primary Schools

ABSTRACT

The study adopted a descriptive survey research design. The population of the study consisted of 14,206 public primary school teachers and 1,406 head teachers in the senatorial districts of Kwara State. The sample for the study comprised 440 respondents selected using a multistage sampling procedure. A self-designed, validated research instrument titled "Staff Development and Teachers Job Performance" (SDTJP) was used to collect data for the study. The reliability of the instrument was ensured with a coefficient index of 0.77. The collected data were analyzed using percentage scores and regression analysis. The result shows that the frequency of conducting the program for the Kwara State primary school teachers was once every session for some programs (88.4% and termly for others (68.2%) in Kwara State primary schools. Developmental programs significantly influenced staff job performance in the schools, 58.9% (Adj. R² = .589). The study concluded that the development programs for teachers in Kwara state primary schools were carried out termly, while some other ones came up once in a session. It was also discovered that developmental programs significantly influenced staff job performance in the state primary schools. It was recommended that the government endeavor to add conferences as part of the professional development programs made available for primary school teachers in Kwara State to enhance their pedagogic skills and competence towards meeting the expectations of the general public.

Copyright © 2023 ETDCI.
All rights reserved.

Corresponding Author:

Fashiku Christopher Oluwatoyin

Department of Educational Management, Faculty of Education, Obafemi Awolowo University, Ile-Ife, Nigeria

Email: fashxtopher@gmail.com

1. INTRODUCTION

Teachers' job performance is significant and indispensable in maintaining the school standard and the realization of national educational goals (Dutta & Sahney, 2022; Dirsu et al., 2022); it also entails the degree to which teachers carry out their professional jobs. On this note, it is imperative to investigate the various ways of improving their performance in the school system by the government. A good teacher's performance on

instructional tasks in the school is equivalent to that of a good functional teacher ([Rostini et al., 2022](#); [Ho et al., 2023](#)).

The responsibility of the Federal, State, and Federal Ministries of Education, as well as the Universal Basic Education Board (UBEB) and school administrators, is to achieve the schools' aims, whereas teachers must maximize the school's return by fulfilling the school's goals and objectives. As [Okeniyi \(2013\)](#) reported, good school management is expected to be a result of good job performance in the school. The managerial roles of the school management include controlling, directing, and managing all activities regarding the education enhancement of the school system.

The term "job performance" refers to the way and manner in which an activity is being carried out. Performance can also be perceived as the completion of a task in comparison to predetermined standards of accuracy, speed, cost, and completeness ([Sokolova & Lapalme, 2009](#)). The execution of a certain activity judged against the established or identified standards of accuracy, completeness, cost, and speed is referred to as performance. In an employment contract, performance is defined as the fulfillment of a commitment in such a way that the performer is released from all contractual obligations.

Apart from competitiveness and productivity, efficiency and effectiveness are components of performance. Training appears to be a means of improving an individual's performance. Efficiency is concerned with one's attainment of the desired goal with minimum input, while the effectiveness of the teacher is concerned with the attainment of the stated objectives. The term "good performance" refers to how well employees complete the task at hand ([Haryanto et al., 2022](#)). Employees in every organization to which the school system belongs are held to certain standards in terms of their performance. They are considered good performers when they perform to the specified standards and meet organizational expectations. Teachers' task performance refers to how they carry out their teaching jobs in the school. All the work that teachers are expected to accomplish daily in the school organization, including lesson planning, classroom management, student assessment, and the like, is used to evaluate teachers' performance and good teaching methods ([Taylor et al., 2000](#); [Mergendoller et al., 2013](#)).

Others are more routine administrative and operational tasks. Lesson planning is an integral part of teaching that takes place days before a lesson is delivered. Some of the most important responsibilities of the teacher are to plan, develop, and organize lessons ([Fujii, 2019](#)). Day-to-day teaching duties become considerably easier and more successful when lessons are planned effectively since it simplifies teaching in the long run. Every day, whether formative or summative, students should be assessed by the teacher in the classroom ([Beers, 2020](#); [Gallardo, 2021](#)). If one does not consistently measure students' comprehension, one will not be able to discern if his or her training is effective.

Teaching methods seem to be a frequently ignored teaching duty that can make all the difference between a good and bad teacher. Teachers must decide what will work best in their classrooms in terms of course delivery, adjustments, and changes for special needs students. Effective teachers conduct extensive research and maintain an open

mind to make informed conclusions about the choice of methods to be used in the classroom regarding these issues (Bardach et al., 2022). He or she must keep up with the current advances and seek new tools to add to their teaching arsenal that will help them improve their teaching. Considering this, teachers have a significant and vital role to play in properly preparing young people for their duties in society as a whole and to attain the specified national educational goals. The impact of the teacher can be seen in every sector of society.

Staff development, according to Stedman et al. (2009), is the process of providing chances for employees to improve their knowledge, skills, and performance under the organization's goals and values, as well as the employees' interests and requirements. Staff development focuses on organizational learning and is delivered by the organization, an employee group, or an individual worker at a time when it is needed. It highlights the idea that organizations will advance to the extent that people develop and evolve. Staff development allows educators to keep up with the ever-growing body of knowledge in the field of education so that they can continue to improve their conceptual and practical skills (Shulman, 2013).

The goals of staff development are to provide scheduled opportunities for employees to gain the knowledge and skills they need to function at the level of competency required in their current and future positions, to create an environment that encourages personal fulfillment, institutional efficiency, human innovation (Elanaga & Imran, 2013), and system renewal, to support the core aims of the school system, to improve and deliver high-quality teaching and learning for students, and to establish sustainable and meaningful programs that enable system staff to collaborate and to achieve the system's goals as well as their personal goals in the areas of achievement and satisfaction.

It seems that many inexperienced teachers find classroom management to be the most intimidating aspect of teaching (Kochenderfer-Ladd & Pelletier, 2018). However, with a few techniques and some effort, a workable classroom management strategy may be created to assist in keeping the classroom under control. Depending on their school, locale, state, and area of specialization, every teacher is expected to fulfill additional professional responsibilities. These might range from responsibilities like hall duty during planning periods or after school to more involved tasks like those required to complete recertification criteria (professional development, college courses, etc.). Teachers can also go above and beyond by sponsoring a club, serving on a committee, or hosting learners' after-school study sessions in their classrooms. While these sacrifices are not always required, they are frequently encouraged. In Kwara State primary schools, all of these are expected in teachers' task performance.

Staff development is thus a process aimed at improving job comprehension, promoting more effective job performance, and setting future career goals (Tallerico, 2005; Wei et al., 2009). It also aids employees in better understanding their roles and duties. Staff development programs are intended to increase the quality of classroom instruction while also assisting individuals in professional growth. Teachers' professional development is a process in which they reflect on, refresh, and expand their

commitments as change agents to the moral ends of teaching, as well as acquire and critically develop information through each phase of their teaching career, the knowledge, skills, preparation, and practice with children, young people, and colleagues. Every organization is supposed to be dedicated to empowering people by fostering an inspiring and equitable working environment.

As a result, staff development programs are aimed at improving job understanding, encouraging more effective task performance, and setting long-term career goals. It aids employees in comprehending their obligations. It's a possibility for new and seasoned instructors and teaching assistants. These activities are intended to increase the quality of classroom learning while also allowing individuals to further their careers. Teachers' contributions to the educational system should not be downplayed. According to studies, the first and most essential instrument that molds students' academic performance level is teachers' input and involvement in terms of their task performance ([Louis et al., 2011](#)). This indicates that a school's success, particularly in the areas of learner engagement and results, is determined by the quantity and quality of teachers' involvement. Every educational institution is required to be devoted to empowering members by fostering an equal and encouraging working environment.

Teacher development can be defined as "the professional progress a teacher achieves as a result of obtaining more experience and thoroughly assessing his or her teaching." When considering professional growth, it's important to consider the content of the experiences, the mechanisms by which professional development will take place, and the setting in which it will occur. Professional development is a process that involves teachers improving their knowledge, abilities, and attitudes. It also entails the role of creating, preserving, evaluating, and transmitting knowledge through lifelong learning. Therefore, the ingredients of cultivating and conserving intellectual values, curiosity, and integrity to cultivate these values through inculcation are included in development programs ([Foy et al., 2013](#)). The primary goal of professional development is to increase the quality of teaching and learning as well as the performance of individuals in positions of teaching and administration ([Foy et al., 2013](#)).

Teachers' instructional task performance is central and indispensable to the attainment of the school's stated educational aim and objectives ([Alderman, 2013](#); [Mendoza et al., 2023](#)). Teachers have to efficiently and effectively carry out their instructional tasks in the schools through appropriate lesson plans, lesson notes, use of instructional materials, effective application of teaching methods, and class management. Teachers need to conduct continuous assessments promptly, regularly mark students' scripts properly, and grade them accordingly ([Zhang & Zhang, 2022](#)). Doing these requires quite some up-to-date knowledge and skills through a series of government development programs like seminars, conferences, workshops, mentoring, and the like. All these were found to be in place with the primary school teachers through the Kwara state government. Yet complaints abound by stakeholders in education in Kwara State about poor pupils' performance in the school. Quite several works can be found on teachers' job performance at this level of education, but there is a dearth of

information about the influence of staff development programs on teachers' instructional task performance in Kwara state primary schools, hence this study.

The objectives of this study were to:

- i. Investigate the frequency of staff development programmes for primary school teachers in Kwara State;
- ii. As certain the influence of the development programmes on staff job performance in Kwara State primary schools.

In this study, the following questions were addressed

- i. How frequently do Kwara State primary school teachers go for staff development programmes?

The following hypothesis was formulated to serve as a guide to this study:

Ho: There is no significant influence of staff development programmes on teachers' job performance in Kwara State primary schools.

2. METHOD

The study adopted a descriptive survey research design. The population of the study consisted of 14,206 public primary school teachers and 1,406 head teachers spread across the three senatorial districts and 16 local government areas of Kwara State. The sample for the study comprised 40 public primary school teachers and 40 head teachers. The multi-stage sampling procedure was used to select the sample. Two senatorial districts were purposefully selected for the study, as the third senatorial district of the state has been bandit-infested at the time of this investigation. Thirdly, a proportional random sampling technique was used in selecting five and three local government areas from the sampled senatorial districts, respectively. From the local governments sampled, five schools were randomly selected. Also, from each school, 10 teachers with a minimum of five years of teaching experience were purposefully selected. This enabled them to share their experience on the influence staff development programs have on teachers' task performance in their schools. The headteachers of the sampled schools were purposefully selected.

A self-designed research questionnaire titled "Staff Development and Teachers Job Performance (SDTJP)" was used to elicit information from the teachers and the head teachers on staff development and teachers' instructional task performance in Kwara state primary school. It has two sections. The first section contained demographic information about the respondents, while the second section contained items that were used to elicit information from the teachers and head teachers on the issue relating to staff development and teachers' instructional task performances. The researcher used a close-ended question where the respondents were asked to choose the extent to which they agreed or disagreed with a given statement on the issue raised by the researcher. The researcher used a four-point Likerts scale to determine the extent to which the respondent perceived the questionnaire items. The instrument was validated before it was used. Its reliability coefficient was 0.77. Data for the study was collected by the researchers and analyzed. All information collected through the questionnaire was

compiled, analyzed, and discussed by the researcher. The researcher used the descriptive statistics of frequency counts and percentage scores in analyzing the data collected.

3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

3.1 How frequently is the program conducted for Kwara State primary school teachers?

To answer the research questions raised, 440 copies of the questionnaire were used to investigate the types of staff development programs available for primary school teachers in Kwara State, and descriptive statistics of frequency count and percentage scores were used to analyze the data generated. The response options of 4 points for Very Frequent (VF) and 3 points for Frequent (F) were merged as Frequent, 2 points for Not Frequent (NF), and 1 point for Not At All (NA) were merged as Not Frequent, respectively. The results are presented in Table 1.

Table 1. Percentage Analysis of the Frequency of Conducting Staff Development Programmes for Kwara State Primary Schools Teachers

No	How frequently do Kwara state primary school teachers go for staff development programmes	F	%	NF	%	Total	%
1	Once every Month	195	44.3	245	55.7	440	100
2	Once every term	300	68.2	140	31.8	440	100
3	Once every session	389	88.4	51	11.6	440	100

Source: FieldWork

The result shows that 195 (44.3%) of the respondents agreed that the program was conducted once every month, and 245 (55.7%) disagreed. Also, 300 (68.2%) of the respondents indicated that the program was conducted once every term, while 140 (31.8%) disagreed. Equally, 389 (88.4%) of the respondents show that the program was conducted once every session, while 51 (11.6%) disagree.

Hypothesis

Ho: There is no significant influence of staff development programs on teachers' task performance in Kwara State primary schools. To test the hypothesis, a multiple regression statistical tool was used.

Table 2. Influence of Staff Development Programmes on Teachers' Task Performance in Kwara State Primary Schools

Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of the Estimate
1	.771 ^a	.594	.589	.36650

a. Predictors: Mentoring, Workshop, Conferences, Seminars, In-service training

Source: FieldWork

In Table 2, the result yielded a coefficient of multiple regressions (R) = 0.771 and a multiple R -square = 0.594. The result suggests that staff development programs, when combined, accounted for 58.9% (Adj. R^2 = .589) of the variance in teachers' task performance in Kwara State primary schools. The other factors that accounted for 41.1% of the variance in teachers' task performance are not reflected in the model. This implies that an increase in staff development programs will lead to an increase in teachers' task performance.

Further analysis of the significant influence of staff development programs on teachers' task performance in Kwara State primary schools is shown in Table 3.

Table 3. Model summary showing the Significant Influence of Staff Development Programs on Teachers' Instructional Task Performance in Kwara State Primary Schools

Model	Sum of Squares	Df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
Regression	85.822	5	17.059	126.996	.000 ^b
Residual	58.297	444	.134		
Total	143.591	449			

a. Dependent Variable: Teachers' Task Performance

b. Predictors: (Constant), Mentoring, Workshops, Conferences, Seminars, In-service training

Source: FieldWork

Table 3 presents the analysis of variance (ANOVA) for the model. The F-statistics value is 126.996 with a degree of freedom of 5 at an alpha level of 0.05. The outcome of the analysis indicated that the reported F-statistics are significant (0.000) and less than the alpha level of 0.05, indicating that the model is fit. The implication of this is that staff development programs positively influence teachers' instructional task performance in Kwara State primary schools.

3.2 Discussion

Based on the analysis in Table 1, it can be deduced that the frequency of conducting staff development programs for Kwara State primary school teachers was once every session, while some other ones were mounted termly. The finding of the study is in line with the finding of [Olabisi \(2013\)](#), who found that teachers' professional development programs in Ogun State were done once a term or a year. The finding is also in line with the finding of [Bright & Innocent \(2015\)](#), who found that teachers in secondary schools in Ogun State usually attend training programs to enhance their professional capacities.

Staff development programs positively influenced teachers' job performance in Kwara State primary schools, in which in-service training programs, workshops, seminars, and mentoring had a positive and significant influence, respectively, on teachers' task performance, while conference attendance was not significant. The finding corroborated the finding of [Olabisi \(2013\)](#), who found that there was a significant relationship between teachers' professional development programs and students' academic performances in public secondary schools in Ogun State. Also, the

finding is in line with the finding of Foy et al. (2013), who showed that professional development had a positive influence on teachers' attitudes toward work and improved the quality of teaching and learning for those with teaching and management responsibilities. The finding is in line with the finding of Sultana et al. (2012), who found that workshops as part of the professional development program are a type of planned and systematic training activity that enhances levels of skill, knowledge, and competency that are necessary for teachers to perform effectively in their daily tasks.

4. CONCLUSION

The study concluded that the development programs for teachers in Kwara state primary schools were carried out termly, while some other ones came up once in a session. It was also discovered that developmental programs significantly influenced staff task performance in the state primary schools.

Based on the findings and conclusion of this study, the following recommendations are made, among others:

1. The government should increase the frequency of professional development for primary school teachers in Kwara State monthly. This would enhance the quality of their instructional task performance.
2. The government and management should endeavor to add conferences as part of the professional development programs made available for primary school teachers in Kwara State to enhance teachers' pedagogical skills and competence toward meeting the expectations of the general public.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The researchers acknowledge the Department of Educational Management, Faculty of Education, Obafemi Awolowo University, Ile-Ife, Nigeria. Kwara State Ministry of Education, Kwara State Universal Basic Education Board, Headteachers and teachers of state primary schools in Kwara state senatorial districts who supply us with the needed information for the study. We are indeed very grateful for your cooperation and contribution to the success of the study.

REFERENCES

- Alderman, M. K. (2013). *Motivation for achievement: Possibilities for teaching and learning*. Routledge.
- Ayeni, A. J. (2010). Teachers' instructional task performance and principals' supervisory roles as correlates of quality assurance in secondary schools in Ondo State. *Unpublished Doctoral dissertation, Obafemi Awolowo University, Ile-Ife, Nigeria*.
- Ayeni, A. J., & Akinola, O. B. (2008). Influence of principals' leadership styles and motivation of teachers on quality assurance in secondary school: A case study of Ondo State. *Ife Journal of Theory and Research in Education*, 2(1-2), 162-170.

- Bardach, L., Klassen, R. M., & Perry, N. E. (2022). Teachers' psychological characteristics: Do they matter for teacher effectiveness, teachers' well-being, retention, and interpersonal relations? An integrative review. *Educational Psychology Review*, 34(1), 259-300. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10648-021-09614-9>
- Beers, M. J. (2020). Formative and Summative Techniques to Assess Student Learning. *High impact teaching for sport and exercise psychology educators*.
- Bright, C. M., & Innocent, A. A. (2015). Mentoring as staff development strategy for effective programme implementation in Nigerian universities. *International Journal of Multidisciplinary Research and Development*, 2(3), 367-371.
- Dirsa, A., BP, S. A., Diananseri, C., & Setiawan, I. (2022). Teacher role as professional educator in school environment. *International Journal of Science Education and Cultural Studies*, 1(1), 32-41. <https://doi.org/10.58291/ijsecs.v1i1.25>
- Dutta, V., & Sahney, S. (2022). Relation of principal instructional leadership, school climate, teacher job performance and student achievement. *Journal of Educational Administration*, 60(2), 148-166. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JEA-01-2021-0010>
- Elnaga, A., & Imran, A. (2013). The effect of training on employee performance. *European journal of Business and Management*, 5(4), 137-147.
- Fujii, T. (2019). Designing and adapting tasks in lesson planning: A critical process of lesson study. *Theory and Practice of Lesson Study in Mathematics: An International Perspective*, 681-704.
- Federal Republic of Nigeria (2004). National Policy on Education. (4th ed.) Lagos: NERDC Press
- Foy, P., Arora, A., & Stanco, G. M. (2013). TIMSS 2011 User Guide for the International Database. Supplement 1: International Version of the TIMSS 2011 Background and Curriculum Questionnaires. *International Association for the Evaluation of Educational Achievement*. <https://eric.ed.gov/?id=ED544556>
- Gallardo, K. (2021). The importance of assessment literacy: Formative and summative assessment instruments and techniques. *Workgroups eAssessment: Planning, Implementing and Analysing Frameworks*, 3-25. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-15-9908-8_1
- Haryanto, B., Suprapti, A. R., Taufik, A., & Maminirina Fenitra, R. (2022). Moderating role of transformational leadership in the relationship between work conflict and employee performance. *Cogent Business & Management*, 9(1), 2105578.
- Ho, H. C., Poon, K. T., Chan, K. K. S., Cheung, S. K., Datu, J. A. D., & Tse, C. Y. A. (2023). Promoting preservice teachers' psychological and pedagogical competencies for online learning and teaching: The TEACH program. *Computers & Education*, 195, 104725. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compedu.2023.104725>
- Kochenderfer-Ladd, B., & Pelletier, M. E. (2008). Teachers' views and beliefs about bullying: Influences on classroom management strategies and students' coping with peer victimization. *Journal of school psychology*, 46(4), 431-453.
- Kwara State (2008). *Education Strategic Plan (ESP) 2009-2018*. [https://www.esspin.org › download › 16-file-1247819568-kwara_education](https://www.esspin.org/download/16-file-1247819568-kwara_education).
- Louis, K. S., Leithwood, K., Wahlstrom, K. L., Anderson, S. E., Michlin, M., & Mascal, B. (2010). Learning from leadership: Investigating the links to improved student learning. New York, NY: Wallace Foundation.
- Louis, K. S., Leithwood, K., Wahlstrom, K. L., Michin, M., Gordon, M., Thomas, E., Anderson, S. E., Mascal, B., Strauss, T., & Moore, S. (2011). Learning from leadership: Investigating the links to improved student learning: Final Report to Research to the Wallace Foundation. Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota.

- Mendoza, N. B., Yan, Z., & King, R. B. (2023). Supporting students' intrinsic motivation for online learning tasks: The effect of need-supportive task instructions on motivation, self-assessment, and task performance. *Computers & Education*, 193, 104663. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compedu.2022.104663>
- Mergendoller, J. R., Markham, T., Ravitz, J., & Larmer, J. (2013). Pervasive management of project-based learning: Teachers as guides and facilitators. In *Handbook of classroom management* (pp. 593-626). Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203874783-31>
- Obasi, F. N., & Asodike, J. N. (2014). *Educational Resource Management*. Port Harcourt: Pearl Publishers.
- Okeniyi, C. M. (2013). Relationship between Leadership Problems and School Performance in Senior Secondary Schools in Katsina State. *Unpublished M.(Ed.) Dissertation Usman Danfodiyo University, Sokoto*.
- Olabisi, M. A. (2013). The effectiveness of teachers' professional development programmes on students' academic performance in selected Ogun State public secondary school. A Thesis Submitted to the Department of Educational management, University of Ilorin.
- Rostini, D., Syam, R. Z. A., & Achmad, W. (2022). The Significance of Principal Management on Teacher Performance and Quality of Learning. *Al-Ishlah: Jurnal Pendidikan*, 14(2), 2513-2520. <https://doi.org/10.35445/alishlah.v14i2.1721>
- Shulman, L. S. (2013). Those who understand: Knowledge growth in teaching. *Journal of Education*, 193(3), 1-11. <https://doi.org/10.1177/002205741319300302>
- Sokolova, M., & Lapalme, G. (2009). A systematic analysis of performance measures for classification tasks. *Information processing & management*, 45(4), 427-437.
- Stedman, R., Lee, B., Brasier, K., Weigle, J. L., & Higdon, F. (2009). Cleaning up water? Or building rural community? Community watershed organizations in Pennsylvania. *Rural Sociology*, 74(2), 178-200.
- Sultana, A., Irum, S., Ahmed, K., & Mehmood, N. (2012). Impact of training on employee performance: A study of telecommunication sector in Pakistan. *Interdisciplinary Journal of contemporary research in business*, 4(6), 646-661.
- Tallerico, M. (2005). *Supporting and sustaining teachers' professional development: A principal's guide*. Corwin Press.
- Taylor, B. M., Pearson, P. D., Clark, K., & Walpole, S. (2000). Effective schools and accomplished teachers: Lessons about primary-grade reading instruction in low-income schools. *The elementary school journal*, 101(2), 121-165.
- Yusuf, A. A. & Fashiku, C. O. (2016). Professional development programme: A veritable tool for improving teachers' productivity in north central zone public junior secondary schools, Nigeria. *Bulgarian Journal of Science and Education Policy (BJSEP)*, 10(1), 39-52.
- Wei, R. C., Darling-Hammond, L., Andree, A., Richardson, N., & Orphanos, S. (2009). Professional learning in the learning profession. *A status report on teacher development in the United States and Abroad*. Dallas, Tx: National Staff Development Council.
- Zhang, X. S., & Zhang, L. J. (2022). Sustaining Learners' Writing Development: Effects of Using Self-Assessment on Their Foreign Language Writing Performance and Rating Accuracy. *Sustainability*, 14(22), 14686. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su142214686>